

ORANGE COAST COLLEGE

Academic Senate Meeting | February 27, 2024 | 11:30 am - 12:30 pm | Student Union 214/Zoom Link: <https://cccd-edu.zoom.us/j/89711704637>

Academic Senator Attendance

Karen Baker, Math & Sciences	Present	Lee Gordon, at-Large, President	Present
Jason Ball, Part Time Faculty	Present	Kelly Holt, at-Large	Present
Carol Barnes, Counseling	Present	Marilyn Kennedy, Lit & Lang, PDI Chair, Secretary	Present
Lauren Becker, at-Large	Present	Jodie Legaspi-Kiaha, Athletics & Kin	Present
Eric Budwig, Technology	Present	Irene Naesse, at-Large	Present
Irving Chavez Jimenez, at-Large	Present	Jeanne Neil, Business & Computing	Present
Eric Cohen, Consumer & Health Science	Present	Lori Pullman, Curriculum Chair	Present
Sean Connor, at-Large	Present	Sara Qubbaj, Part Time Faculty	Present
Eric Cuellar, at-Large	Present	Loren Sachs, at-Large	Present
Jodie Della Marna, Library	Present	Katherine Sheehan, Visual & Performing Arts	Present
Rendell Drew, at-Large, Vice President	Present	Jordan Stanton, Social & Beh. Sciences	Present
Cyndee Ely, Part Time Faculty, Parliamentarian	Present	Vacant, ASOCC Student Presentative	Vacant

Please see the Voting Tally Chart after these minutes for individual member's votes.

Guests (Optional & Voluntary Sign-In): Tara Giblin, Rob Schneiderman, Tyler Boogar, and Anna Hanlon.

1. Preliminary Matters

- A. **Call to Order:** President Gordon called the meeting to order at 11:31 A.M.
- B. **Public Comments:** Classified Senate President John Fawcett.
- C. **Approval of the Minutes: Motion 1: Senator Kennedy moved to approve the February 13, 2024, meeting minutes; motion seconded; motion approved with two abstentions.**

Motion 2: Senator Kennedy moved to approve the February 20, 2024, meeting minutes; motion seconded; motion approved with two abstentions.

- D. **For the Good of the Order:**

Senator Cuellar: CLEEO Project is going to be participating in the CRPP Grant. They are hosting Dr. Louie Rodriguez, Professor of Education, from UC Riverside. Dr. Rodriguez is a former McNair Scholar. He holds two master's degrees and a Ph.D. from Harvard University. He studies under Dr. Pedro Noguera. He will be presenting "Reflections of Excellence: Building Institutional Pedagogies for Latino Student Success." At this event, opportunities for compensation will be available. This will be on March 13, 4:15-5:45 p.m. in GEC Room 109.

Senator Legaspi: Stated that there is a movement happening in the Athletics Department, particularly when it comes to supporting and coaching softball. Softball has been struggling for support in terms of equity for the last couple of decades. She has been the head coach at OCC for nearly ten years. They were fortunate enough to have

the support of the OCC Foundation, Doug Bennett, Rena Quinonez and company, Jason Kehler, Michael Sutliff, the Athletics program, and M&O Department led by Frank Garcia and company. Five months ago, they took on a locker project so that the players would have a place to put their equipment and get ready prior to practices and games. They had no place to change. They were in the parking lot changing from classroom attire into practice attire. A total room transformation occurred in the old shed space and twenty-two beautiful wood lockers were installed last week, thanks to Maintenance and Operations. On behalf of the athletes and future recruiting coaching staff, she wanted to thank all the involved parties, as well as our President, Dr. Suarez, for creating action to our diversity, equity, and inclusion mission and helping to support our female student athletes along their journey.

Senator Ely: Communities of Practice for Part-Time Faculty will be hosting a dinner coming up in week seven, on Thursday, 4:30- 6 p.m. They will be highlighting the Technology, Horticulture, the Garrison Honors Center, etc. They will be starting at the Student Union. Food will be provided.

2. Consent Agenda:

A. **Institutional Effectiveness Committee Representative:** John Dale

Motion 3: Motion 3: President Gordon moved to approve the consent agenda; motion approved unanimously.

3. Officer, Senator, & Committee Reports

A. **President and Vice-President Reports:**

1. **President Gordon:**

Artificial Intelligence: Reported that the item "Artificial Intelligence (AI)" will now be a standing item on the agenda going forward. Given that there is so much news on AI on a constant basis, faculty will no longer need to ask to agendize this item; they can simply provide an update when the Senate gets to the agenda item under "Officer, Senator, and Committee Reports." This has been practice, for topics under DEIA, for example.

Career Education: Stated that today we will have the first in a planned series of presentations on career education at OCC. Curriculum Chair Lori Pullman teaches horticulture and landscape design, one of the many career programs here at OCC. We will highlight a different career education program at each Senate meeting for the rest of the semester, as our scheduling permits.

Flex Day: Stated that on today's agenda, the Senate has set aside time for a recap of Flex Day. It is a chance to provide feedback on the event last week. He attended those presentations via Zoom led by Senators Cuellar, Chavez Jimenez, Drew, as well as the CFE Union session.

Online Advisory Board: Noted that today, the Senate will briefly introduce the topic of the status of the Online Advisory Board (OAB) within the framework of the college's governance structure. President Gordon shared a list of Committees from the Decision-Making Document that report to the Senate, including the OAB. The OAB Bylaws voting membership will be limited to the faculty. Each division will have one member of the committee.

2. **Vice-President Drew:** Attended Flex Day as a faculty representative. Announced there is currently a call out for the Academic Standard Committee; there are currently two volunteers.

B. Union/Bargaining Unit Report - CFE President Rob Schneiderman:

CFE has tickets for the hockey game, Ducks vs. The Kraken, on April 5. The tickets are \$10 each, and if interested, email him or Maria (maria@cfe911.org) for more information. It is \$5 Friday at the location so the food will be low cost. The retirement party for Bob Fey will be held at Kenwood's on May 15, at 5 p.m.

C. Diversity, Equity, Inclusiveness and Accessibility (DEIA) Initiatives - Senator Eric Cuellar:

On March 8, they will have the kickoff presentation on the opening training to launch the Cultural Synergy Institute for the Culturally Responsive Pedagogy and Practices Grant. They will be hosting Professor Michelle Bean from Rio Hondo College. She is an English professor. The outcome of the presentation will include:

- Equity and inclusion analysis of course outlines of record
- Intersectionality review of assignments, materials, and teaching approach
- Teaching strategies that retain BIPOC students
- Culturally responsive pedagogy training with best practices to implement.

Professor Bean has served as Academic Senate President for Rio Hondo College in the past. She has served at the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges being at-large representative and an Area C representative.

D. Budget Update – Senator Ely: Recognized the OCC Budget Committee and particularly Rachel Kubik and her team for developing an easy-to-read dashboard. The dashboard is reviewed every meeting, every month. There are three basic areas. The first section with the big circle is the funding sources, and that shows you by percentage where our money is coming from. You can see that the largest portion, 62%, is unrestricted general funds.

When you move to the right, you see the budgeted expenses by fund. There are three major categories: labor expenses, operating and capital expense outlay, and outgoing reserves. They are color coded to match where the dollars come from to match how that expense is paid. You can see that 84% of our labor costs are coming out of the unrestricted general fund. On the second circle to the left, it is budgeted expenses. That shows you where our budgeted expenses are, what they are made up of. Instructional salaries are different than non-instructional. Capital expense outlay, are there any outgoing and reserves? You can see that we are at \$5.1 million, and then the auxiliary fund reserves, we are at \$11 million. It is a quick dashboard. It is a good way to get familiarized with where the money is coming from at OCC and where the money is going at OCC. **President Gordon:** Reiterated and thanked Rachel Kubik and the committee for creating an easy-to-read dashboard. They did several revisions to make it understandable. We often hear that number about how at the high point, 94%, the expenditures were going to personnel. Now it is down to about 90%. That does not include operating expenses and capital expenditures, which to most people is part of the cost of running the institution. When you add that back in you get a different picture of what we are spending in total on salaries. **Senator Ely:** Stated that we have not run comparisons with other colleges. Overall, in general, the recommendation is that your budget should not be more than 85% of salaries in total. We have consistently been running between 90% and 95% as a district. **President Gordon:** One thing that should be pointed out is that that 94% to 95% was the high point because of the austerity measures that they put in place, that number has already come down halfway to the District's target. The District is using a statewide benchmark. There are many districts in the interior of California where the cost of living is much lower, where you can get by with a lower total percentage for salaries. **CFE President Schneiderman:** You mentioned that it is

standard practice for companies or organizations to have it be about 85%, but is that 85% of all expenses or just of the selected expenses like we do it as a district? **Senator Ely:** My understanding is that that is a Chancellor's Office recommendation that it should be at 85%. Because when we roll too high, and our reserves start going down and we start dipping into reserves, that is when we start getting flagged. **CFE President Schneiderman:** Asked specifically for the equations, what is in the denominator? **Vice-Chancellor Serban:** Wrote on the chat, "it is as a percentage of all unrestricted general fund expense." **Senator Kennedy:** Suggested to have someone come and explain to the Senate about how to analyze and read the last three years of the budget and what happens when there are funds set aside from the District that are then moved to other areas, and that happens repeatedly [forensic accounting]. It would be helpful. We need a comparative analysis and more information. That could be a workshop in a Flex Day session. **Senator Ely:** I will direct to the Budget Committee again because I only shared one document with that was one page, the dashboard. The OCC Budget Committee does review all expenditures and all income, and in a comparison, from this point in time, in this semester to the same point in time last year. It is only a year's comparison, but we do have that information, and it is available in the Budget Committee documents in detail.

E. Artificial Intelligence (AI): Senate Member Reports:

Senator Ely: Reported a personal story from her Business English class, an asynchronous 100% online course. Part of her regular and substantive interaction is that her students have to post in discussions, and they are not supposed to regurgitate any material that they have learned in the course. It is asking them to post their opinions on something related to the course. They get points just for doing it. She had a student whose discussion post began with "As I am AI, I cannot give an opinion" and proceeded to give four paragraphs as to why they could not give an opinion. The student got reminded that AI is not acceptable in the course as outlined in the syllabus and all instructional materials. **VP Drew:** Reported that he had an international student yesterday use his phone to help him translate for the test. He felt uncomfortable with the student using it. He asked to what extent they allow the students to bring or use their phones? He had him sit in the front as he did not talk to him beforehand that he would be using it. He seeks direction. **Senator Kennedy:** Reported that she had a student who submitted into their class discussion their AI question as well, only it was about bathroom shower equipment, and the submission was attached to an unrelated word in the assignment. She reported that **English Professor Jeremy Zitter** spent his sabbatical studying AI, and he shared the PowerPoint with her. It is amazing that 50% of students in high school and college admit that they use AI regularly. Senator Kennedy noted that students know which professors are aware of AI misuse and which ones are not aware. If you allow it to be used in your class, that is fine. If you do not allow the use in your class, then it is not fine. She had a similar case to that of Dr. Drew's with the misuse of a translation app. **Senator Qubbaj:** Reported that she had attended Professor Zitter's Flex session on AI. There is the impression that they are waiting for the Senate to come up with a policy on this. Most people at the session agreed that they prefer a policy that refers to the department and not the instructor themselves because they are worried that different instructors in the same department will have completely different policies on that. Then that will divide the students with what classes they choose. Another faculty member stated that this seems like something similar when the internet was first implemented, so there is hope on how to navigate AI in the future. Another thing that came up is how to define AI. What do we consider AI? Translation software? Grammar correction software? Are those AI or is it just Chat GPT? **Senator Cuellar:** Added that we

need more guidance in becoming more literate with these skills and learning the appropriate uses of how to utilize artificial intelligence. Even a web search is artificial intelligence in itself. We need to understand the role of AI. **Senator Kennedy:** Supports Senator Cuellar's statement, but the problem is that there is no thinking involved with students who use AI in an unauthorized way. They tend to copy and paste. The District AI policy is coming to the BPAP committee where it has been discussed. She was advised by Steve Ricard, the student conduct officer, that when you make a policy for your classroom, do not specifically list the name of a product because you are going to forget something or something else will be renamed. She states in her syllabus what they can use only. Other than that, it is a no, or they can ask her for clarification. We do need to educate students on the appropriate use and over time, it may become integrated in a way that is more intellectually challenging, and that would probably be a welcome advancement. **Senator Ball:** The idea of using AI in a challenging way, is that one way to use it is you could have AI write your essay and then have the students critique the essay. The mission of the college overwhelmingly, at least 90% of my students overwhelmingly, are here to transfer. Once they transfer in to almost any discipline here [UCLA] is what the work they will be doing constitutes: They are going to be listening to lecture material from someone who produces original research. That material is just their material. It is not a generic Political Science 100 that everyone teaches. It is their take on their topic that they are the only expert on. Then what they have to integrate that with is a combination of paywalled academic articles which AI will not have access to or academic publishing, books, academic books. They will have to synthesize these things to produce their own original interpretation and take. That will be the case in chemistry where they will be reading scientific publications. It will be the case in English. It will be the case in Poly Sci. It will be the case in Econ. AI does not prepare them to do that. If they use AI here and they get to there, and we have not prepared them to engage and create original interpretations based on unique works, they are going to fail. We will have done them a disservice. I really believe that should be our default position. I understand that there is a certain logic to "this was same thing with the Internet and are we behind the times and all," but there is still the world they are going to, and none of these AIs prepare them for that world. In fact, they hurt them.

- F. **Other Committee Reports:** **President Gordon** shared a list of all the committees that report to the Senate. He encouraged them to report to the Senate once per semester. **Senator Kennedy:** Asked if the Basic Skills Taskforce is still in place as per the list. She does not believe it is. **President Gordon** said that those that update the Decision-Making document need to make the update.

4. Unfinished Business

No unfinished business.

5. New Business

- A. **Chancellor Yamamura's First Amendment Memo, January 9, 2024: Senate Consideration and Adoption:** **President Gordon** asked unanimous consent to defer the discussion of Chancellor Yamamura's First Amendment memo. The Chancellor has asked the senates to deliberate and vote on it, but there is still some analysis to come in. With no objection, the Senate deferred that to an upcoming Senate session.
- B. **Recap on Flex Day:**

VP Drew summarized the PowerPoint Presentation that he presented in his Flex session. The new information presented from previous reports about the grant was about the stipends and how much is available for those that attend and lead presentations. He showed a few examples of topics for professional development sessions. He acknowledged Professor Cooper for her participation and presentation on liquid syllabi. It was an example of how to make documents accessible to students as requested by the grant. He showed the QR code to access the proposal form. He thanked the faculty and encouraged faculty to participate. **Senator Kennedy:** Reported on feedback from some of her division faculty about the keynote speaker. They were not happy with the costs of message of the presentation and felt that it had little value in terms of what we are doing academically, and that there needs to be more feedback from the faculty as a whole about what we would like to see as a keynote speaker. A faculty member forwarded to her a link to a speaker who is doing focused, on-the-ground work in DEIA who would be an excellent speaker. As to the liquid syllabi, if, as it showed, it still needs to be continually edited and updated, hopefully that is between semesters, as most faculty do, but during the semester, unless there is a major problem, most students are very uncomfortable with lots of changes during the semester to the syllabus rules.

Senator Chavez Jimnez: On March 8, there is an opportunity for anyone interested in attending this grant information session to sign in on the day of the event. If you want to become involved beginning with that event and other ones that are soon to come, you can sign in person. If we make changes, as far as RSVP, we will communicate that to you. But if you just show up you will be able to attend. **Senator Cuellar:** Participants will be compensated at \$500 per session. **Senator Baker:** There has been some feedback in the Math and Science division that they would like to see activities that relate to things that we have to do like EEO training, transportation training, etc. and providing that kind of material on Flex Day.

Motion 4: President Gordon moved to add two more minutes to this agenda item; there were no objections; motion passed.

Senator Becker: The feedback she received is that this Flex session in particular did not have a lot of non-departmental sessions that could be attended. **Parliamentarian Ely:** If you did not meet your Flex requirement on Flex Day, you can earn one hour of Flex credit if you attend a Communities of Practice.

C. Online Advisory Board (OAB) Bylaws:

Parliamentarian Ely: They worked with the existing group that has been operating as the Online Advisory Board (OAB), and they have made a lot of effort to try and get this all back into and under the Academic Senate, with the appropriate information. The name of the committee is still the Online Advisory Board. It is a standing committee of the Academic Senate of Orange Coast College. She read the mission of the committee to the Senate. The membership is open to part-time and full-time faculty. The Academic Senate will send out the call to each division to identify their division representative. The length of the service has no term limits. Individuals who resign may be replaced through an open call from the Academic Senate. Voting members include any officers and all faculty members. Nonvoting members include the Academic Senate President. They will have a committee chair which will be the Online Faculty Coordinator. This also aligns their responsibilities with the MOU. There is no executive board. The committee will schedule to meet once a month during the academic year, and the committee will determine the day and time. A quorum shall be formed with a simple majority of the membership. Subcommittees will be formed on an ad hoc basis to accomplish specific tasks as charged by the Academic Senate, or as seen as appropriate by the Online Advisory Board. These subcommittees may be formed from volunteers or by open

invitation to faculty. The Online Advisory Board is an advisory group of the Academic Senate, and therefore subject to the Brown Act, and the meetings are held in accordance with the most current publication of *Robert's Rules of Order* and amendments may be made by a majority vote of the committee membership. The committee values greatly the input and the guidance from the classified professionals. They are still welcome to participate and provide input. They just cannot vote.

President Gordon: Stated to add the word "faculty" in front of the word "volunteers" on section 8 of the proposed bylaws. **Senator Kennedy:** Almost all of the bylaws of other committees have some kind of secondary officers, like people who take notes, secretary and vice president. Otherwise, you rely on one person. There are going to be times when that is going to have to be dealt with. You want to already have it laid out how that is going to be dealt with. I would recommend that there be a vice chair, and a secretary, and that should be part of the faculty group. **VP Drew:** Stated that there would be consistency in the language through the bylaws. At the top it says, "a Standing Committee" and in number 9, it says "an advisory committee". **Senator Kennedy:** Agreed with VP Drew for consistency. It will be revised to say "standing committee" in both places.

Faculty Online Coordinator Barbara Cooper: Stated that the OAB has been working really hard, and there's probably some communication that they can do better. One of the things has been the concern on getting faculty members from each division to serve on the advisory committee. They actually started in 2016, trying to get the Senate to clarify exactly what the responsibility of this committee was, and these are the bylaws. The committee has been in existence since 2008, and she has been a member of the committee since. So, they asked. She asked in 2016, Charlene Reed asked in 2018, and there should be academic minutes to match. Then she became Faculty Online Coordinator, then a different conversation. On October first of 2022, she sent an email to Lee requesting, "How do we fix this issue and have a call out?" He responded, "I'll work on it," at the beginning of 23. We should have at that point been able to have a call out because we had asked to have that done in 22 to 23. She knows there's some animosity towards the Advisory Board and towards her and if anybody says it's not personal, she will tell you why she feels it's personal. They are working very hard, and worked very hard through the pandemic to serve the faculty and always keep the faculty in mind when they make decisions. They do have about eight faculty members who are fairly faithful to the committee. She just wanted to let everyone know that this whole bylaw thing has been ongoing since 22, and she really tried to get help and it finally came to the Executive Board to help them rewrite it about a month ago. **VP Drew:** Thanked her for her diligence and stated that we are in a new place now and need to move forward, and that we have an active, vibrant committee now. The Senate expects reports and will give support to the committee. **Parliamentarian Ely:** Stated that the two updates will be made to the bylaws, and the bylaws will be on the agenda next week.

D. Jobs in Horticulture: Due to time limitations, this was not presented.

E. Acronyms and Metrics: Due to time limitations, this was not presented.

6. Adjournment

President Gordon adjourned the meeting at 12:29 p.m.

Minutes Approved: March 5, 2024

MINUTES: First draft written by Beatriz Rodriguez Vaca, Administrative Assistant to the Senates. Revision of first draft and Senate-approved drafts written by Senate Secretary, Marilyn Kennedy, who also distributes the final Senate-approved version to the Chancellor, Board of Trustees members and secretary, union presidents, GWC and Coastline Academic Senate presidents, OCC College President, and faculty as per OCC Senate bylaws.

Senate Membership & Voting Tally Chart	Minutes 2/13/24	Minutes 2/20/24	Consent Agenda	Motion to extend time by two mins
Baker, Karen: Math & Sciences Senator (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Ball, Jason: Part-Time Senator (2023-2024)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Barnes, Carol: Counseling Senator (2021-2024)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Becker, Lauren: Senator at-Large (Spring 2024)	Abstain	Aye	Aye	Aye
Budwig, Eric: Technology Senator (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Chavez Jimenez, Irving: Senator-at-Large (2021-2024); 11:32am	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Cohen, Eric: Consumer Health Sciences Senator (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Connor, Sean: Senator-at-Large (2023-2024)	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Cuellar, Eric: Senator-at-Large (2021-2024)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Della Marna, Jodi: Library & Learning Senator (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Drew, Rendell: Vice President, Senator-at-Large (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Ely, Cyndee: Parliamentarian, Part-Time Senator (2023-2024)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Gordon, Lee: President, Senator-at-Large (2022-2025)	Abstain	Abstain	Aye	Aye
Holt, Kelly: Senator-at-Large (2023-2026)	Aye	Abstain	Aye	Aye
Kennedy, Marilyn: Secretary, Lit. & Lang. Senator (2022-2025)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Legaspi, Jodie: Athletics and Kinesiology Senator (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Naesse, Irene: Senator-at-Large (2023-2026)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Neil, Jeanne: Business and Computing Senator (2022-2025)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Qubbaj, Sara, Part-Time Senator (2023-2024);	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Sachs, Loren: Senator-at-Large (2022-2025); 11:38am	Absent	Absent	Absent	Aye
Sheehan, Katherine, VPA Senator (2021-2024); 11:32 a.m.	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye
Stanton, Jordan: Social & Beh. Sciences Senator (2022-2025)	Aye	Aye	Aye	Aye